

February 19, 2020

City of Kelowna Planning Department 1435 Water Street Kelowna BC, V1Y 1J4

To whomever it may concern,

RE: Collett House conservation within the proposed development at 2169 Pandosy Street - Kelowna

This report is to comment on the appropriateness of the proposed heritage rehabilitation of the Collett House - 2169 Pandosy Street as part of Pandosy Street Development Ltd. new mixed-use development in Kelowna's health district. The observations enclosed consider the proposal's alignment with the <u>Standards & Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada</u>.



Rendering of the proposed relocated and rehabilitated Collett House, within a new mixed-use development across the street from the Kelowna General Hospital. source: GTA Architecture Ltd.

Understanding the heritage values and significance of the building

Set deep on a large property, the grand-scale and generous proportions of this Foursquare style house reflect the prosperity of the developer in 1913, Horace Carlisle Spedding Collett. H.C. Collett was a pioneer Kelowna businessman who established and ran the Collett Bros. Livery and Dray with his brother James between 1905 and 1913. The construction of this large house on a big property coincided with the successful sale of their business and Collett's transition into orchard management for the Kelowna Land and Orchard Company. From his later residence in Okanagan Mission, Collett remained active in agricultural and business community organizations and was a pivotal member of the Okanagan Historical Society. After the Collett family, this historic house was a residence for subsequent Kelowna families, best remembered as home to two prominent Kelowna doctors, the families of Drs. Campbell and Black (Campbell from 1921-1931 and Black 1940-1952). The Collett House was likely chosen by the doctors for its immediate proximity to the Kelowna Hospital, which has been located across the street from the subject property since 1908. Several smaller homes which used to sits nearby the Collett House have been demolished, making the Collett House a surviving testament to the historic single-family residential character of the eastern side of this block of Pandosy Street.

The 1913 Collett House, is listed on Kelowna's Heritage Register, valued for its association with H.C. Collett and its unaltered Foursquare style with English Arts & Crafts finishes.



The Collett House in the 1920s. source: Kelowna Museum & Archives # 4939

Character Defining Elements (as listed in the City of Kelowna Statement of Significance)

- prominent corner location at Pandosy Street and Royal Avenue, set back on a large property;

- residential form, scale and cubic massing as expressed by its two and one-half storey height and regular, rectangular plan;

- Foursquare style as reflected in its rigorous symmetry and central front entry;

- broad hipped roof with central hipped dormer and wide, closed eaves;

- wood-frame construction with bellcast cedar shingle cladding on the lower two-thirds of the exterior, capped with a broad beltcourse with stucco and half-timbering above;

- additional external elements such as its full-width open front verandah with central steps and shingled columns, rear screened porch with screened balcony above, and two internal red brick chimneys;

- regular fenestration, including single and double assembly 9-over-1 double-hung woodensash windows, triple assembly 6-over-1 and 8-over-1 double-hung wooden-sash windows, fixed 8-pane dormer window, and small square fixed 9-pane rear windows; and

- associated landscape features such as the grassed yard, mature trees and an early woodframe garage.

Design and conservation approach review

The proposed development involves the relocation of the heritage building to the corner of Royal and Pandosy and its adaptive reuse as a public commercial space, likely a restaurant or cafe.

The conservation objective for the Collett House is **Rehabilitation** - "the sensitive adaptation of an historic place or individual component for a continuing or compatible contemporary use, while protecting its heritage value".¹

With new zoning and density goals in the Health District, and a loss of the immediate block's residential streetscape context now rezoned as HD2 Hospital and Health Support Services, the building's deep siting on its property had become an obstacle to its survival, impeding any significant or dense development around it as per the purpose of this zoning. The proposed relocation of the heritage house westward to the corner of Pandosy and Royal, and its integration into the new multi-use complex, will showcase the building at the development's most prominent, high-visibility point. In its new location, the 1913 foursquare house retains its original Pandosy Street orientation, but functions as a feature of the development, standing proud of the new complex. The proposed new use for the Collett House as a restaurant will

¹ Standards & Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada (2nd edition)

further increase its visibility, enabling locals the experience of regularly accessing, enjoying and creating new memories in an iconic historic Kelowna structure, which was previously inaccessible as a private residence.

The conservation objective for the exterior of the Collett House is **Restoration** - "accurately revealing, recovering or representing the state of an historic place or individual component as it appeared at a particular period in its history, while protecting its heritage value".²

Three of the four exterior elevations and an important portion of the roofline and dormer will be conserved and restored in the adjusted location, retaining original finishes - shingles, stucco and half-timbering - where possible, and restoring replicated materials where missing (cedar roof shakes for example). The traditional, character-defining front porch will function as the main entrance to the commercial space. The intent is to retain and refurbish the original windows and the front door set as well - allowing the traditional textures and materials of the heritage house to contrast with the modern, sleeker finishing materials of the new complex.

The unconventional integration of an old house into a new mixed-use high-density building was deemed the only practical way to conserve the Collett House on its original property but may ultimately represent a very robust model of conservation, as the heritage house gains both prominence and public access. The integration of a heritage house into a high profile development could even potentially help to raise awareness for Kelowna's built heritage and heritage conservation program.

To save the building in this manner however, five of the nineteen listed Character Defining Elements will need to be sacrificed. This is not uncommon in rehabilitation projects, and as long as the majority of and most important CDE's are conserved, the overall heritage value of the asset will be as well. It is my opinion that the unfortunate loss of setback, back porch and balcony, chimneys and matures trees as part of the proposed conservation plan, will not compromise the ability to conserve the overall heritage value of the building, as its name, scale and architectural style, the important heritage values identified in the Statement of Significance, will not only be conserved and more visible in the development but also legally protected against any alterations or losses in the future.

² Standards & Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada (2nd edition)

Rehabilitation interventions

In keeping with the Standards & Guidelines (Standard 11 for rehabilitation - additions to historic places), the proposed mixed-use new building is "physically and visually compatible with, subordinate to and distinguishable from the historic place."

Distinguishability - The new mixed-use building's modern, contemporary design and muted palette acts as an ideal backdrop for the contrasting saturated colours and traditional textures and finishes of the historic house. Although connected internally, the heritage house sits slightly proud of the new building and is connected via neutral transitions pieces that allow it to be perceived as a separate structure.

Compatibility - The new building design features distinct separations in finishes between the ground floors and the upper floors, like the heritage house which features distinct cladding, finishing treatments and colours on its two distinct sections. Certain historic finishes from the heritage house (such as painted shingles) are carried out on feature panels and elevations of the new build, further relating the two structures to each other.

Subordinate - While some may argue that to be subordinate an addition must be small or not visible, many additions to historic places include large additions, even towers. To achieve a subordinate relationship, the addition must not 'steal the show' from the historic place. The proposed new building does not compete with the heritage house. The heritage house is very visible as a feature in the proposed configuration.

Summary

Heritage Conservation is a tool for managing change in historic communities. It is my professional opinion that the thoughtful development and creative integration of the heritage house proposed here by GTA Architecture and the developers, is a good conservation solution for a scenario where both context and zoning have changed radically. Although the melding of the heritage house into the new complex may be an unconventional intervention, it was the only solution where the heritage house could be saved on site, and represents a bold statement of conservation efforts and permanent protection. This project will likely bring meaningful revitalization and conservation awareness to this high-traffic cone in Kelowna's hospital district.

Yours Truly,

Manh.

Elana Zysblat heritage consultant, BCAHP