

REPORT TO COMMITTEE



Date: August 16, 2018
RIM No. 1240-20
To: Heritage Advisory Committee
From: Policy & Planning Department (JM)
Address: 180 Highway 33 E **Owner:** Studio 33 Properties Ltd.
Subject: Heritage Register Removal Request

Existing OCP Designation: MXR – Mixed-Use Residential/Commercial
Existing Zone: RU6 – Two Dwelling Housing
Heritage Register: Included

1.0 Purpose

To consider a request to remove the property at 180 Highway 33 E from the Kelowna Heritage Register.

2.0 Proposal

2.1 Background

The Kelowna Heritage Register is an official listing of properties within the community that are identified as having heritage value. Over 200 buildings are currently listed on the Heritage Register and each listing includes a Statement of Significance describing the building's historical, architectural and contextual characteristics.

Properties listed on the Heritage Register may be eligible for the following incentives in recognition of the many benefits of heritage conservation to the community and the challenges that come along with maintaining a heritage building.

Inclusion of a property on the Heritage Register does not constitute Heritage Designation or any other form of long-term heritage protection. The existing development potential of a property is not restricted and the owner is entitled to develop the property in accordance with the permitted uses, density and other regulations of the property's existing zoning. Buildings can be altered and may even be demolished, though there are withholding provisions that enable Council and staff to explore other development options with the property owner.

The subject property is one of six properties in the Rutland area that are identified on Kelowna's Heritage Register. Known as the Sproul Farm House, the home was built around 1906 and was located on an orchard owned by the Sproul family who were among early agricultural pioneers of the Rutland area. According to the Statement of Significance for the property, the orchard and home were sold to Enoch Mugford, who then occupied the property for several decades until his death in 1969.

Since that time, the home has been used for a variety of purposes, from the commercial offices of a local excavation company to varied home based businesses. Today, the property is host to two active business licenses for home-based businesses. Along with these uses have come some alterations to the building and overall deterioration in its condition (see attached photos).

The property was added to the Kelowna Heritage Register in 2001. The evaluation of the property at the time of its inclusion gave it a score of 66 (minimum of 55 points needed). The evaluation results relied on high scores for the home's builder M.J. Curts, from its association with the Sproul and Mugford families, and from its architectural integrity, noting at the time that there had only been "minor changes" to the structure.

On August 8th, the City received an application to remove the property from the Kelowna Heritage Register. The current owners of the property purchased the lot in 2017 and are proposing to demolish the home to make way for a larger redevelopment of the site and its neighbour to the east. The applicant commissioned a heritage consultant to review the home and property (see Attachment 1). The analysis by the heritage consultant concludes that there are some potential errors in the official Statement of Significance that may have resulted in the perception of the home having a greater historical significance than what is justified. Given the results of the review, the applicant is proposing to demolish the building, but is "...open and happy to incorporate some of the elements that give this property its heritage value in the site's future development" (see Attachment 2). In arriving at this conclusion, the applicant examined alternative courses of action, including restoration, incorporation and relocation. The applicant has stated as follows: "Due to the limited land size and the scope of work for the various options, none of them are feasible outcomes for the owner, whether it be preservation/restoration, incorporation, or relocation".

2.2 Site Context

The subject property is located on the northeast corner of Sadler Road and Highway 33 East, just east of Rutland Centennial Park. It is 0.21 acres in area and is zoned RU6 – Two Dwelling Housing. The property is located in a transitional area between the predominantly low-density residential neighbourhood to the northeast, and the commercial development of the Rutland Town Centre immediately to the west. The Future Land Use of the property is Mixed-Use Commercial/Residential (MXR) with the expectation that redevelopment along the north side of Highway 33 will occur over time.

The Statement of Significance for the parcel outlines the character defining elements for the property, as follows:

- Several mature trees in front and side yards
- Residential form, scale and massing, expressed by 1 and 1/2 storey height and rectangular plan

- Medium-pitch gable roof with 2 secondary cross-gables
- Street elevation has full-width open porch with repetitive, evenly-spaced painted wood columns
- Corbelled brick chimney
- Narrow V-joint horizontal wood siding
- Wood shingles in upper part of main gables
- 1-over-1 double-hung wood sash windows on the upper floor, with plain wood trim

Subject Property Map:



3.0 Discussion of Relevant Policies

3.1 Official Community Plan

Objective 9.2 Identify and conserve heritage resources.

Policy 9.2.1 Heritage Register. Ensure that the Heritage Register is updated on an on-going basis to reflect the value of built, natural and human landscapes.

3.2 Heritage Strategy

Strategy 1 – Preserve and Protect Heritage Resources. Continue to preserve and protect significant heritage resources through the use of protection tools and heritage planning initiatives.

Strategy 5 – Update Heritage Register. Continue to identify the City’s significant cultural/natural landscapes, archaeological and built heritage resources.

Report prepared by:

James Moore, MCIP, RPP

Long Range Policy Planning Manager

Approved for Inclusion: Danielle Noble-Brandt, Policy & Planning Department Manager

Attachments:

Attachment 1 – Heritage Assessment and Evaluation, Cummer Heritage Consulting Ltd.

Attachment 2 – Letter of Rationale

Attachment 3 – Supplemental Photos

Attachment 4 – Kelowna Heritage Register Evaluation Criteria