

Heritage Advisory Committee

Minutes

Date:	Thursday, February 15, 2018
Location:	Knox Mountain Meeting Room (#4A) City Hall, 1435 Water Street
Committee Members Present:	Abigail Riley (Chair), Lorri Dauncey (Vice Chair), Stone Tonne and Amanda Snyder
Committee Members Absent:	Ryan Esbjerg (Alternate) and Bob Haynes (Alternate)
Staff Present	Planner, Lydia Korolchuk; Planner, Trisa Atwood; Planner, Emily Williamson*; Planner, Andrew Ferguson; and FOI-Legislative Coordinator, Sandi Horning

(* denotes partial attendance)

1. Call to Order

The Chair called the meeting to order at 12:01 p.m.

Opening remarks by the Chair regarding conduct of the meeting were read.

2. Applications for Consideration

2.1 Vimy Ave 176, HAP18-0002 - Terence & Carolanne Smyl

Staff:

- Displayed a PowerPoint presentation summarizing the Heritage Alteration Permit application for the form and character of a new single detached house within the Abbott Street Conservation Area.
- Advised that even though the subject property is within the Abbott Street Conservation Area, it is not listed on the Heritage Registry.
- Responded to questions from the Committee Members.

Paul Nesbitt, Applicant's Representative:

- Responded to questions from the Committee Members.
- Advised that there was a flood in the crawl space which damaged the floor system and affected the framing.

HAC Discussion:

- The Committee Members made individual comments regarding the application.

Moved by Amanda Snyder/Seconded by Lorri Dauncey

THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommends that Council NOT support Heritage Alteration Permit Application No. HAP18-0001 for the property located at 176 Vimy Avenue, Kelowna, BC in order to construct a new single detached house within the Abbott Street Heritage Conservation Area.

Carried

ANCEDETOAL COMMENTS:

The Heritage Advisory Committee provided the following rationale for recommending that Council not support this application:

- the proposal is inconsistent with the dominant block style and overall characteristics of the adjacent area and the existing home;
- the roof patterns, use of materials and colours does not fit in;
- there is no cohesive style that wraps itself around the structure;
- the proposal stone clad is seen in a rural setting not an urban setting;
- the proposal design does not respond to the characteristics of the area; it is too detailed, needs to be more simplistic;
- a more modern style of the existing home would be more in keeping with what is there.

2.2 McDougall Street 1910, HAP18-0004 - Terry & Blair Squire

Staff:

- Displayed a PowerPoint presentation summarizing the Heritage Alteration Permit application for the form and character of a second storey addition to an existing single family dwelling and existing carport conversion to an enclosed single car garage on the subject property within the Abbott Street Heritage Conservation Area.
- The subject property is not on the Heritage Register.
- Responded to questions from the Committee Members.

HAC Discussion:

- The Committee Members made individual comments regarding the application.

Moved by Lorri Dauncey/Seconded by Stoke Tonne

THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommends that Council support Heritage Alteration Permit Application No. HAP18-0004 for the property located at 1910 McDougall Street, Kelowna, BC in order to construct a second storey addition on an existing single family dwelling and existing carport conversation to an enclosed single care garage on the subject property within the Abbott Street Heritage Conservation Area.

Carried

ANCEDTOAL COMMENTS:

The Heritage Advisory Committee recommended that Council support this application and provided the following comments:

- the proposal should maintain the roofline and simplify the porch area and additions to express the original design;
- the upper floor windows are too vertical and should mirror the windows on the first floor; need to consider the placement, size and orientation of all the windows;
- the introduction of any materials should be consistent with the original design; would prefer to see siding used instead of shingles as shingles is not a material used in the construction of an early suburban home.

2.3 Long Street 2050, HAP18-0001 - Shelly Davies & Gregory Andronik

Staff:

- Displayed a PowerPoint presentation summarizing the Heritage Alteration Permit application for a single family dwelling within the Heritage Conservation Area.
- This is a staff-level application and no variances are being requested.
- Responded to questions from the Committee Members.
- Confirmed that the dwelling currently has a legal secondary suite and is not presently operated as a bed & breakfast.

HAC Discussion:

- The Committee Members provided individual comment regarding the application.

Greg Andronik, Applicant:

- Provided the rationale for the demolition of the existing home.

Moved by Amanda Snyder/Seconded by Lorri Dauncey

THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommends that Council NOT support Heritage Alteration Permit Application No. HAP18-0001 for the property located at 2050 Long Street, Kelowna, BC, in order to construct a new single family dwelling within the Heritage Conservation Area.

Defeated

Abigail Riley and Stoke Tonne – Opposed.

ANCEDTOAL COMMENTS:

The Heritage Advisory Committee provided the following comments with respect to this application:

- the structure is too massive for the small lot and surrounding area;
- the proposed dwelling is not reflective of the original;
- the façade of the building does not fit into the neighbourhood;
- concerned with the demolition of the existing house and would prefer that it be salvaged;
- the colours are not as responsive to the heritage palette and could be better; would like to see the brink changed to something cleaner and brighter;
- the posts are out of character and should not introduce another material at the base.

3. Minutes

Committee Member, Lorri Dauncey:

- Noted that she opposed the recommendation of support for the Heritage Alteration Permit for 188 Beach Avenue.

Moved by Lorri Dauncey/Seconded by Stoke Tonne

THAT the Minutes of the December 14, 2017 Agricultural Advisory Committee meeting be adopted as amended.

Carried

4. Update - Council Decisions

Staff:

- Provided an update regarding the Heritage Alteration Permit Application for 188 Beach Avenue. Based on the comments received by the Committee, the proposal was changed enough that senior staff felt the application now meets the City's requirements.

5. Committee Discussion

The Committee Members would like to receive more information regarding the rationale for demolishing existing heritage structures.

The Committee Members suggested that if the Official Community Plan is to be amended, then the Heritage Guidelines should be updated.

The Committee Members discussed what they would like to include in a potential Report to Council detailing the Committees activities over the Council terms.

6. Next Meeting

The next Committee meeting is proposed for March 15, 2018.

6. Termination of Meeting

The Chair declared the meeting terminated at 1:28 p.m.

Abigail Riley, Chair

/slh